#### THE CALIFORNIA VOTING RIGHTS ACT (CVRA)



Los Alamitos Unified School District August 13, 2019

Ronald D. Wenkart Partner



Why is the governing board of the Los Alamitos Unified School District exploring a change from an at-large system of voting to a district based system?

- The governing board of the Los Alamitos Unified School District is now considering changing from an at-large system of voting to a district based system because the California Voting Rights Act (CVRA) strongly discourages at-large voting and strongly encourages district based voting.
- Every public agency that had an at-large voting system and was sued under the CVRA has lost in court and has had to pay attorney fees to the plaintiffs' attorneys.



#### When was the CVRA enacted?

 The CVRA was enacted in 2002 by the California Legislature and signed by Gov. Gray Davis.

#### What was the intent or purpose of the CVRA?

• The intent of the CVRA was to enhance the voting rights protections embodied in the federal Voting Rights Act. In signing the legislation, Gov. Gray Davis stated that the purpose of the legislation was to provide voters with a cause of action to challenge at-large elections when it was shown that a minority's voting rights have been abridged or diluted.<sup>1</sup>



#### What does the CVRA prohibit?

• The CVRA prohibits the use of any election system (e.g., at large system) that impairs the ability of a protected class (e.g., racial or ethnic minority) to elect candidates of its choice or its ability to influence the outcome of an election.<sup>2</sup>





#### How is the CVRA different from the federal Voting Rights Act?

- While the CVRA is modeled after the federal Voting Right Act, a protected class of citizens does not have to be geographically compact or concentrated to allege a violation of the CVRA.
- Also, proof of intent to discriminate against a protected class is not required.
- A protected class of citizens is defined as a class of voters who are members of a race, ethnic, or language minority group as defined in the federal Voting Rights Act of 1965.3



- Due to the lower threshold of proof, no public agency has prevailed in a lawsuit to date.
- For this reason, and the fact that public agencies are liable for attorney fees if they lose in court, the majority of public agencies have voluntarily implemented district-based elections.





#### Does the CVRA disfavor at-large elections?

- Yes. The CVRA strongly disfavors at-large elections.
- The CPRA defines the at-large method of election as any one of the following methods of electing members of the governing body of a public agency:
  - 1. One in which the voters of the entire jurisdiction elect the members of the governing body;
  - 2. One in which the candidates are required to reside within given areas of the jurisdiction and the voters of the entire jurisdiction elect the members of the governing body; and



3. One which combines at-large elections with district-based elections.<sup>4</sup>





#### How does the CVRA define district-based elections?

• The CVRA defines district-based elections as a method of electing members to the governing body of a political subdivision in which the candidate must reside within an election district that is a divisible part (usually five or seven district or trustee areas) of the political subdivision and is elected only by voters residing within that election district.<sup>5</sup>



#### How does the CVRA define racially polarized voting?

• The CVRA defines racially polarized voting as meaning voting in which there is a difference in the choice of candidates or other electoral choices that are preferred by voters in a protected class, and in the choice of candidates or other electoral choices that are preferred by voters in the rest of the electorate.<sup>6</sup>





#### When is the at-large method of voting in violation of the CVRA?

• The CVRA states that an at-large method of election may not be imposed or applied in a manner that impairs the ability of a protected class (e.g., racial or ethnic minority) to elect candidates of its choice as a result of a dilution or abridgment of rights of voters who are members of a protected class.<sup>7</sup>



#### How is a violation of the CVRA determined?

 A violation of the CVRA is established if it is shown that racially polarized voting occurred in elections for members of the governing board or in elections incorporating other electoral choices by the voters of the political subdivision.<sup>8</sup>





How is racially polarized voting determined?

- The occurrence of racially polarized voting in violation of the CVRA is determined from examining the results of elections in which at least one candidate is a member of a protected class or elections involving ballot measures that affect the rights and privileges of members of a protected class.
- A school district may be ordered by a court to implement a district based election system if racially polarized voting is found.



#### What remedies are available under the CVRA?

- Upon a finding of a violation, the court must implement appropriate remedies, including the imposition of districtbased elections that are tailored to remedy the violation.<sup>9</sup>
- Proceeding before litigation is initiated makes the process voluntary and allows more time for a thoughtful process.





#### May the court award attorney fees to a successful plaintiff?

- In an action to enforce the CVRA, a court shall award the prevailing plaintiff reasonable attorney's fees and litigation expenses including, but not limited to, expert witness fees and expenses as part of the cost.
- Prevailing defendants shall not recover any costs, unless the court finds that the action was frivolous, unreasonable, or without foundation.<sup>10</sup>



#### Has the CVRA been held to be constitutional by the courts?

Yes. In <u>Sanchez v. City of Modesto</u>, 11 the Court of Appeal held that the CVRA was constitutional.



#### What is the process for drawing the boundaries for trustee areas?

- The process begins with two public hearings during Board meetings.
- During the public hearings, the members of the public may provide input to the Board on the criteria and composition of proposed trustee areas.



- Following the second public hearing, the Board will consider a Resolution that identifies criteria for the demographer to use in preparing draft maps of trustee areas.
- Usually the demographer will prepare at least two sets of draft trustee area maps and an election plan identifying which trustee areas will hold elections in 2020 and 2022, for the Board to review.





- The demographer will then draft maps and a third and fourth public hearing will be conducted to obtain public input regarding the content of the draft trustee area maps and proposed sequence of elections.
- Following the fourth public hearing, the Board will vote on a Resolution adopting a trustee area map and sequence of elections and authorize submission of the proposal to the Orange County Committee on School District Organization.
- The Board will also vote on submitting a waiver request to the State Board of Education.



- The Orange County Committee on School District Organization will then hold a public hearing within the boundaries of the District and consider approval of the proposal to change the District's election system to a district based system and to consider approval of the trustee area maps.
- Following approval by the Orange County Committee on School District Organization, the proposal goes to the State Board of Education for approval and following State Board of Education approval, the district based system goes into effect.



#### Footnotes

- <sup>1</sup> Stats, 2002, ch. 129 (SB 976), Governor's Signing Statement.
- <sup>2</sup> Elections Code section 14027.
- <sup>3</sup> Elections Code section 14028(d).
- <sup>4</sup> Elections Code section 14026(a).
- <sup>5</sup> Elections Code section 14026(b).
- <sup>6</sup> Elections Code section 14026(e).
- <sup>7</sup> Elections Code section 14027.
- <sup>8</sup> Elections Code section 14028(a).
- <sup>9</sup> Elections Code section 14029.
- <sup>10</sup> Elections Code section 14030.
- <sup>11</sup> 145 Cal.App.4<sup>th</sup> 660 (2006).



#### QUESTIONS?



#### Disclaimer

This AALRR presentation is intended for informational purposes only and should not be relied upon in reaching a conclusion in a particular area of law. Applicability of the legal principles discussed may differ substantially in individual situations. Receipt of this or any other AALRR presentation/publication does not create an attorney-client relationship. The Firm is not responsible for inadvertent errors that may occur in the publishing process.

© 2019 Atkinson, Andelson, Loya, Ruud & Romo

